Transforming Communication in Textual Scholarship: Open Annotation for Electronic Editions

Anna Gerber
Roger Osborne

The University of Queensland
Introduction

Open Annotation Collaboration

Examples of annotations for electronic editions
- Annotated Edition: Commentary & Explanatory Notes
- Variorum: Describing textual variation
- Critical Edition: Annotating textual variation to establish a text
- Collaboration: questions and replies

Tools & services: lorestore & lore

Concluding remarks
Annotations are additional information attached to a digital resource or part of a resource that do not modify the original content of the resource.
Apparatus

Critical Edition with apparatus as footnotes

From:


Apparatus

“[Driver] Webster: E1” — “rough-looking[rough-/ lookin’] E2 TZ rough-looking[E3 rough looking]
EXPLANATORY NOTES

These Explanatory Notes clarify allusions, historical references and eccentric phrasings not otherwise covered in Historical Background, Places in Robbery Under Arms and Glossary. Biblical quotations are from the King James Version.

Chapter I

1 (p. 9) mauleys. For this and other unusual words and Australianisms, see Glossary.

2 (p. 9) and them... miserable life. RB may have revised his manuscript at this point, adding 'them that brought... curse mother?', but without fully clarifying the insertion: see Sample Collation. The question mark after 'mother' may, however, be intentional (cf. following entries, ibid.): RB often seems to score the emotional fluctuations by means of unconventional or carefully positioned punctuation.

3 (p. 9) robbery under arms. Cf. the 1864 Victorian Act, 25 Vict. no. 335 s. 111: 'Whosoever shall be found with any offensive weapon or instrument rob or assault with intent to rob any person... shall be guilty of felony. [Note] Robbery under arms.'

4 (p. 10) again the... rails. See entry c on p. 10. Et's correction of the informal or Scots dialect form is not accepted: see OED2 entry again and B5, and cf. 504:14 ('knocks his head agin the yard' — in Ben Marston's voice) and 453:35. There is other evidence of either a light editing for Et or corrections in proof; and RB's or Lucy Darley's sporadic correcting of the copy of Et sent to England as printer's copy for Et cannot be ruled out: see Introduction, pp. xl, xlv-1.

5 (p. 11) We'd been drinking all night at that Willow Tree shanty. RB seems to have forgotten this when he got to the episode of the final battle: see 564-4-6; the inn is now 'The Traveller's Rest' (557:29).

6 (p. 15) They didn't collar... as they do now. The 1861 Acts of the Alienation and Regulation of Crown Land, proclaimed in Sydney early in 1862, allowed free selection of crown land from 40 to 320 acres, requiring the selector to pay a quarter of the purchase price and reside on the land, with the balance to be paid three years later.

Glossary

This is a glossary of Australianisms, dialect words, slang, colloquialisms and other unfamiliar words in Robbery Under Arms. Thanks to its use of first-person narration by a working-class Australian, the novel is especially rich in these. RB had a very good ear for spoken dialogue, and 539:29 - 540:9 demonstrates his interest in how a particularly Australian form of the English language was developing.

Definitions are based on those in the Australian National Dictionary, ed. W. S. Ramsey (Melbourne: Oxford University Press, 1988) and the Macquarie Dictionary, ed. A. Delbridge (North Ryde, NSW: Macquarie Library, 2001), and with reference to various dictionaries of slang. Further information may be found via the index of pastoral and other terms in J. S. Ryan's edition in one volume of S. W. Silver & Co.'s Australian Grazier's Guide (1870) and its continuation No. VII — Cattle (1881), both by RB (Armidale, NSW: Centre for Australian Language and Literature Studies, 1994).

The definitions give only the meaning in the text; they are not exhaustive. Where a word derives from an Aboriginal language, its name is given. The most frequently cited is Dharuk, a language of the Sydney region.

all-fours (28:4) American card game.
all roads (13:20) In every way.
all to pieces (17:13) Completely, i.e. there is a perfect match.
all was blue (112:20) Said of the effect of drinking on the eyesight; to indicate drunkenness (colloquialism).
ancest or anigh (106:13) Near. Cf. 'nigh hand' (43:1:25), near at hand; at 44:3-10, nearly.
axle tree (8:23) Metal bar connecting wheels on a cart or carriage.
baccy (360:9) Tobacco (colloquialism).
back and edge (33:1:13) Loyally, through thick and thin.
Annotations supporting Scholarly Editions

- Record notes and annotate variations:
  - Provide additional information about Textual Variation
  - Textual notes (about production of text)
  - Explanatory notes (meaning, historical context etc)
  - Link texts with facsimiles, reference secondary sources

- Facilitate collaborative discussion of texts, sources and facsimiles
  - Comments
  - Questions
  - Replies
Annotation approaches

- TEI annotations
  - Inline
  - Standoff

- Offline annotation systems (e.g. PDF, XML annotation, eReader devices)

- Web-based annotation systems
  - Primarily tagging, commenting

- Community-driven modelling efforts:
  - Annotea
  - Annotation Ontology (AO)
  - Open Annotation Collaboration (OAC)
  - W3C Community Group established to align OAC and AO
Open Annotation Collaboration
Open Annotation Collaboration

Collaboration between

• Los Alamos National Laboratory
• University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
• University of Queensland
• University of Maryland
• George Mason University

Funding: Andrew W. Mellon Foundation

http://openannotation.org/
Open Annotation Collaboration

- Aims to enable the sharing and interoperability of scholarly annotations across annotation clients, collections, media types, applications and architectures
- Provides an RDF-based model for annotations on web resources
- Based on Linked Data principles
Semantic Web Standards

- Resource Description Framework
  - Triples: subject, predicate, object
  - Allows graph-based data structures

dcterms:abstract "On Our Selection (1912) is a theatrical adaptation of On Our Selection! (1899)".

- RDF Schema & Web Ontology Language (OWL)
  - Define vocabularies / models with formal semantics
  - Vocabularies may themselves be standardised e.g. Dublin Core
Linked Data

- Use URIs for identifiers
- Use de-referenceable HTTP URIs (rather than URNs)
- Use semantic web standards (e.g. RDF, SPARQL)
- Include links to related resources to create a ‘web of data’
OAC Model

- Basic model:
  - Annotation
  - Body
  - Target

- Body and target of an annotation can be of any media type.

- Implicit "annotates" relationship between Body and Target (i.e. Body is "about" the Target)

- Designed to be extended e.g. through subtyping oac:Annotation:
  - ExplanatoryNote
  - TextualNote
  - VariationAnnotation
Additional Properties

- Typical annotation characteristics:
  - Annotation created by an author (human, software agent)
  - Annotation occurred at a particular point in time
Segments of Resources

- Most annotations are about part of a resource
- Different segments for different media types:
  - Text: paragraph, arbitrary span of words
  - Image: rectangle or polygon
  - Audio: start and end times
  - Video: area and times

Segments described using URI fragments or constraints
+ Annotation examples
Commentary or Annotated Edition

ANNOTATIONS

The number and letter introducing each note identify page and paragraph.

Title Page Buln-buln (Fred Falldin-Pritchard). Bulan Bulan (also bulan-buln and buln-buln) is the Aboriginal (Waywurru) word for the superb lyre bird (Divisa 89). Of the two species, Purphly clearly has Musara aurata louisiana (a mind (see B5-195).

Title Page Brogla (Barfoot Bob). From the Kamilaroi and common word for the large grey and pink crane, Grus rubicicax. Brogla performs a courtship dance in which they strut and prance about with considerable grace. The brogla is also called the native companion because it was frequently seen in the vicinity of Aboriginal communities (Division 87-88). An early working title of BB was 'The Lyrebird' (Letters to William Cocks on 14 May 1901 and 17 Nov. 1902, and to A.G. Stephens, 18 Oct. 1901, cited in Barnes & Hoffman 66, 105, and 74), and later, 'The Lyrebird and the Native Companion' (letter to Judith Purphly, 20 June [1905], Barnes & Hoffman 205).

11a expert One who knows and manages machinery in rural trade. Stearing teams still have to attend to. Wilber furnishes a name of Steele Rudder (On Estes Creek, 1923) where the 'expert' is one who fixes resaps and binders.

11b Mohawk Twine Binder A binder that is reaper that can handle and tie the own grain. Early binders, called Marsh harvesters, required two men to ride on the platform to tie the gathered grain into sheaves. Around 1870, a binder that used wire to tie bundles automatically was introduced, but proved unsatisfactory. Story wire damaged machinery and even killed livestock when it was swallowed with fodder. By 1889, a binder had been developed that could knot twice automatically; but they were not used. In 1884 (see RR 259). In RR 233, Rigby refers to a Mohawk wire binder just superseded by a new imported string binder by the same maker—good enough for a new thing, but as yet requiring a certain amount of brain-worship and exubration. There is also mention of a rival machine. Purphly wrote of the period after the failure of his business in 1883: 'Have since been employed in Shepparton Implement Works, with an interval of a year and a half, as travelling expert for the Hornby binder' (cited by A.G. Stephens in the 1921 Preface to RR). His brother John's Purphly Foundry employed him in 1884 to service Hornby Reapers and Binders for which they were agents (Barnes 141). It is possible that the name of the Mohawk Twine Binder is fictional and perhaps chosen to indicate a supplier-based in the United States.

11c Coffee Palace Temperance hotel or guest house, so called because it was not licensed till liquor. There were two in Echuca. Heather Ruddle of the Echuca Historical Society believes that Purphly, assuming he has in mind a specific building, refers to the one facing High Street in the port area which had a view of the river, and was operated for many years by the Chambers family. The coffee palace run by the Weymouth family was (so far from the river to afford a view, and acquired its second story much later than Purphly's time frame. Mrs Ferguson's Coffee Palace also features in RR xvii.

11d through train Echuca was on an extension of the Melbourne-Bendigo mainline, and the through train was a direct service from Melbourne. It is not clear why he did not then choose to catch the Falldin-Pritchard.

11e (which passed the Customs duty-free) If there was no manufacturer in Victoria, presumably the goods entered Victoria duty-free, a saving of 20% (Henry Cornish, Under the Southern Cross, Higgs/botham & Co., Macfar, 1880, 2nd facsimile edition, 1975, 105).

11f well-organized Union Not in the usual sense, rather an alliance formed for collective commercial advantage.

11g Labour Unions The mid-1880s and 1890s saw a sharp increase in the number and power of organized labour unions. The Australian Shearers' Union, founded in 1886, was especially strong. The class-enemy of the shearer was not the small farmer but rather the pastoralist (John Merritt, The Making of the AVU, Oxford University Press, Melbourne, ch. 6).

11h cat-whipping Taking out one's misfortunes on a vulnerable, innocent party.

11i Essendon A suburb of Melbourne.

11j present vocation Fred's reference to Tom's occupation will recall to a Purphyophile that between 29 March 1884 and the spring of that year, Tom Collins was 'unemployed' (at last), a period in which—to use his words—of 'from the fictionals of the world of Si, and 85—the 'worst' SL, the 'then Collins of RR is, as in SL, a writer who engages in metafictional commentary.

11k Mr. Wagborn In RR 233, Jeff Rigby is the recipient of a letter from Wagborn of Echuca, who appears to be a commercial rival to Milligan Brothers.

11l Go thou and do likewise Cf. 'Go and do thou likewise' (Luke 10:37), but in the context of procrastination, perhaps a faint echo of 'Be fruitful, multiply, and replenish the earth' (Genesis 1:28; or 2:27, or 8:17; 25:11).

12a Here was a holiday, just forced on me This 'holiday' recalls the Judy's famous (or notorious) words with which SL opens: 'Unemployed at last!' in SL 1.1, and notes, 105, 462.

12b Campaspe junction The Campaspe River enters the Murray downstream (west) of Echuca.

12c Darwin's masterly and almost unreadable monograph on Earthworms Darwin's last book, The Formation of Vegetable Mould, through the Action of Worms, with Observations on their Habits (1881) (ed. by Sir Albert Howard, ed., Faber and Faber, London, 1945), although scholarly, is immensely readable. Croft's reading of RB suggests that Darwin is used to make implicit critique of social Darwinism and the 'ethic of natural selection', and the 'selfish individualism' of Pepys and Defoe (Croft 251-53). Certainly, the treatise demonstrates the industriousness of earthworms, and their capacity to process colossal quantities of overburden and enrich soils.

12d kangaroo dog A greyhound-coursing dog, bred for hunting kangaroos. A well-trained dog fetched a high price. In SL and RR Pep is an important, and invariably, mayhem-inducing 'character'.

12e in the dead vast and middle of the night (Homer 11, 198).
**Print:**

Esceca, who appears to be a commercial rival to Amingar Brothers.

11e Go thou and do likewise Cf. ‘Go and do thou likewise’ (Luke 10:37), but in the context of procreation, perhaps a faint echo of ‘Be fruitful, and multiply, and replenish the earth’ (Genesis 1:28, or 1:22, or 8:17, 9:7, 35:11).

Using OAC:

![Diagram of OAC notation]

Cf. ‘Go and do thou likewise’ (Luke 10:37), but in the context of procreation, perhaps a faint echo of ‘Be fruitful, and multiply, and replenish the earth (Genesis 1:28)’. 

Heard of your present vocation only yesterday. Called at your warehouse and saw Mr Waghorn in his office. Devilish nice fellow. Obtained your present address. Suits me down to the ground. Had made preparations for a trip to Echuca by Excursion Train. Can you meet me on the platform? Can you recommend lodgings, quiet, respectable, and not expensive for self and—and—prepare yourself! Wife and three (3) children, if you please!! Go thou and do likewise!!! We intend to stay a few days in Echuca.
<http://example.org/annotations/annotation1>

rdf:type <http://www.example.org/lit-annotation-ns#ExplanatoryNote> ;

oac:hasBody <http://example.org/notes/NOTE1> ;

oac:hasTarget <http://example.org/texts/BulnBuln1948.html
#xpointer(string-range(id("page11")/p[5], "", 1, 22))> .

<http://example.org/texts/BulnBuln1948.html#xpointer(string-range(id("page11")/p[5], "", 1, 22))>

dcterms:isPartOf <http://example.org/texts/BulnBuln.html >.
Collaboration & discussion

While not deemed suitable for *The Buln Buln and the Brolga*, this passage is significant to the argument of *Such is Life* (1898). Furphy is much more concerned with exploring the "fiction of facts" and the "facts of fiction" in the typescript version. Returned to their previous context, the unrevised sections of the *Buln Buln and the Brolga* perform a different function in a significantly different narrative.

---

TS continues with a long paragraph in which Jeff Rigby, who was dropped from BB and SIL, advises Mrs Falkland-Pritchard on her career as an authoress. Rigby identifies Dickens, Rousseau’s *Social Contract*, Paine’s *Rights of Man*, *Uncle Tom’s Cabin* and *Don Quixote* as works that marked an epoch and brought about moral revolution. Some of the exchanges originally given to Rigby in TS fall to Tom Collins, but never any serious moralising about life or art.

... Come now! Of course, you could see through Fred right enough; but then, Bob could see through your king or prince just as clearly. The fact is, that authority or precedence, however ridiculous, being once accepted and enthroned, is apt to paralyse judgment. There is an unnoted undercurrent of significance in the confession:—“All we, like sheep, have gone astray.” Like sheep! Ay, heaven help thee, cross-bred jumbuck! Amen.

When the Buln-buln and Brolga returned to their seat, I looked through the window and proposed a walk along the river...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACT III, SCENE III</th>
<th>257</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>And bees; and all around are many bees,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>And the rough walls are clothed with long soft grass;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A simple dwelling, which shall be our own;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where we will sit and talk of time and change,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As the world ends and hours, ourselves unchangeless.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What can hide man from mortality?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>And if ye sigh, then I will smile; and thou,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time, shall shatter fragments of sea-smile,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Until I weep, when ye shall smile away</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The tears she brought, which yet were sweet to shed.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We will entangle boughs and flowers and leaves.</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[E.321.] Which trouble on the fountain's brink, and make</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[E.329] Strange combinations out of common things.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Like human ladies in their brief moment.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>And we will search, with looks and words of love,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[E.321] For hidden thoughts, each lower than the last,</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our unsubstantial spirit, and like leaves</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Touch'd by the shock of the enclosure's wind,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weave harmonies divine, yet ever new.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From difference sweet where discord cannot be;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 20 made E                                             | 28 weep.—R ye R |
| 21 grain E                                            | 29 shed E Fr   |
| 22 corn E                                             | 30 & flowers, & beams E flowers, |
| 23 & E & change E                                      | L beams—A      |
| 24 & E unchanged —E                                   | 31 bring & E    |
| 25 Man R Mortality—E mortality—E R                   | 32 things E     |
| 26 use, & thou E                                       | 33 improper E   |
| 27 shall chant E Fr                                   | 34 improper E & E improper E |
| 28 in E                                               | 35 thoughts E & E last E Fr   |
| 29 be, & E                                            | 36 spring, E Fr  & R W Fr   |
| 30 this line was first                               | 37 sung E       |
| 31 & & E                                              | 38 be, & E, & E R Fr   |

| 25 [Foot] What 160 Shelley's running count, follows this line. |
| 26 A word after and directs to the above the line.         |
| 27 The word is certainly shall and not shall.              |
| 30 This line was first                                      |
| 31 We will entangle boughs & flowers, & make              |
| Then oppose Shelley writes:                               |
| 28 beams                                                 |

| 29 Which trouble on the fountain's brink, and make the verse included in Shelley's running count: |
| 34 162 Shelley's early count, below And                |
| 35 170 Shelley's running count, follows this line.      |
| 36 and above [all]    exhausted in Kendall.             |
Describing variation

This is a recurring replacement for *authoress* in TS. Sometimes *Mrs Pritchard* is substituted.

---

Endeavouring to recall. I shall draw your attention to it at the proper time and place. Go to, then.

The photos turned the conversation in the direction of Aboriginal life; and Bob, of course, was soon modestly pulling stroke; the authoress, for reasons of her own, listening with hungry interest.

After some time, Bob seemed to feel himself looming too conspicuously in the foreground; and his low, impassive monotone came to an awkward stop.

"But, Mr Bruce," said the authoress eagerly, "aren't the poor creatures often treated cruelly by new settlers?"

The conversation being turned in the direction of Aboriginal life, Bob, of course, was soon pulling stroke; Mrs Pritchard listening with vivid interest.

After some time, the bushman seemed to feel himself looming too conspicuously in the foreground; and his low, impassive monotone came to an awkward stop.

"But, Mr Bruce," said the lady eagerly, "aren't the poor creatures often treated cruelly by new settlers?"
Describing recurring variations

This is a recurring replacement for *authoress* in TS. Sometimes *Mrs Pritchard* is substituted.
Annotating variation within a Critical Edition

Furphy appears to have tested a revision on TsA, by striking through ‘running in a single steer’ and beginning a replacement that started with ‘shouldering’ before leaving the revision alone. By the time Furphy completed the BBB Ts, ‘trying to turn’ had been inserted. This suggests that another document lies between TsB and TsA.
Attaching structured metadata
Interoperability Challenges

- Migration / querying annotations across versions
- Targeting segments regardless of document format
- Targeting variants
- Digital surrogates
- Identifying abstract entities (e.g. FRBR Work, Expression, people, places etc)
  - Shared vocabularies
  - Identification guidelines e.g.
    - http://persistent.example.org/texts/WorkAuthor/WorkTitle/Publisher/Year/…
- Functional interoperability
Tools & services
Annotation repository

lorestore

- Search, query, display & visualise annotations & resource maps
- REST API for creating, retrieving, updating and deleting annotations

Young Ladies Journal

Body

http://austlit.edu.au/ausslit/annotations/body/1C41B1C9E18CEB63

Constrained Target

constrainedBy: (http://www.openannotation.org/ns/PrefixSuffixConstraint)
    prefix: needs in the
    exact: Young Ladies Journal,
    suffix: and — Heaven

Find replies  Get TiG  Get TiX  Get RDF/XML  Visualize

Use browser View Page Source to see underlying annotation RDF

github.com/uq-eresearch/lorestore/
Annotation tool

lore annotations
- Firefox add-on
- create, edit, search, browse annotations and resource maps

github.com/auselit/lore/
An Old Mate Of Your Father's

"I often wonder if you like you, Tom." It did seem strange to the children to hear him address the old man by his Christian name—considering that the mother always referred to him as "Father." She called the old mate "Mr. So-and-so" (whatever his name might have been), and father called him "Bill," or something to that effect.

Occasionally the old mate would come dressed in the latest city fashion, and at other times in a new suit of "reach-me-downs," and yet again he would turn up in clean white moleskins, washed tweed coat, brown tie, and slouch hat. (Quoted from the original manuscript.)

As I read it, HL first changed the double inverted commas to single ones. AJ then added a single inverted comma to give the reading "Mr." But HL must then have deleted the closing inverted comma, again in pencil, though elsewhere AJ seems to have marked up the text only after HL had confirmed changes in red.
“In the next fifty years the entirety of our inherited archive of cultural works will have to be reedited within a network of digital storage, access, and dissemination. This system, which is already under development, is transnational and transcultural”

– Jerome McGann

AustESE

eResearch Tools to Support the Collaborative Authoring and Management of Electronic Scholarly Editions

Workflow Engine

Workbench Web Portal

Text Import & Mark-up
Text & Image Alignment
Collation & Textual Analysis
Collaborative Annotation & Tagging
Electronic Edition Publishing

Content Repository

Web-based tools


Funded by
nectar
Acknowledgements

- Jane Hunter  
  ITEE eResearch Lab, The University of Queensland

- Desmond Schmidt  
  ISI, Queensland University of Technology

- Paul Eggert  
  School of Humanities & Social Sciences  
  University of New South Wales

- Damien Ayers  
  Aus-e-Lit, ITEE eResearch Lab, The University of Queensland

- Tim Cole, Tom Habing, Bernhard Haslhofer, Ray Larson, Cliff Lynch, Michael Nelson,  
  Doug Reside, Robert Sanderson, Herbert Van de Sompel (OAC)

- Funding:  
  - Aus-e-Lit: NeAT  
  - OAC: Andrew W. Mellon Foundation  
  - AustESE: NeCTAR